

World Vision الرؤية العالمية

Giving Hope to Children in the Holy Land

Word Vision Jerusalem - West Bank - Gaza **CHILD WELL-BEING** Annual Report **FY 15**

Contents

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations	3
Executive Summary	4
Introduction	5
Strategic Goals	7
Education, Protection & Participation	7
Economic Development	13
Health & Nutrition	17
Faith in Development	22
Disaster Management	24
Development Programme Approach	26
Learning from FY15 CWB Reporting Process	27

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

ADP	Area Development Programme
AMENCA	Australia Middle East NGO Cooperation Agreement.
AP	Area Programme
AusAID	Australian Agency for International Development
CAG	Community Active Groups
СВО	Community Based Organization
СВС	Community Business Council
CFS	Child Friendly Space
СІ	Confidence Interval
CWB	Child Well-being
СШВА	Child Well-being Aspiration
СШВО	Child Well-being Outcome
СШВТ	Child Well-being Target
DEC	Disaster Emergency Committee
DFAT	Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
ED	Economic Development
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
FY	Fiscal Year
GBV	Gender Based Violence
НН	Households
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organization
JWG	Jerusalem-West Bank-Gaza
KSCO	Keeping Children Safe Online
LEAP	Learning through Evaluation with Accountability and Planning
LQAS	Lot Quality Assurance Sampling
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MCHN	Maternal Child Health and Nutrition
ΜοΕ	Ministry of Education
МоН	Ministry of Health
MoL	Ministry of Labour
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MVC	Most Vulnerable Children
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NO	National Office
NYF	National Youth Forum
oPt	Occupied Palestinian Territory
PAF	Programme Accountability Framework
PCBS	Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics
PCEI	Palestinian Church Engagement Initiative
PFA	Psychological First Aid
PNS	Private Non Sponsorship
PSS	Probability proportional to Size Sampling
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
ТР	Technical Programme
ttC	Timed Targeted Counseling
WB	West Bank
WV	World Vision
WVI	World Vision International

Executive Summary

World Vision Jerusalem-West Bank-Gaza proudly distinguishes itself from other international NGOs working in Palestine because of its Christian identity, its strong community base and an unwavering commitment to the well-being of children.

During FY15, World Vision Jerusalem-West Bank-Gaza directly contributed to the well-being of 92,485¹ children and impacted indirectly the lives of a further 131,734 children. Progress was made towards all six of JWG's strategic goals, primarily via three Technical Programmes, which provide the basis for all AP programming.

Contributions towards Strategic Goals 1, 3 and 6 (combined under the Education, Protection and Participation Technical Programme) directly benefitted 51,915 children. Most of the benefits were in the education sector, a strong and muchneeded programming focus given the poor reading comprehension level of the majority of Palestinian students. Yet, this report also highlights serious Child Protection issues, particularly children exposed to violence, and that these issues are receiving insufficient attention by World Vision.

Economic development is another focal area and 12,712 children were indirect beneficiaries of JWG's Economic Development Technical Programme (strategic goal 2). Positive results have been achieved, although it is too early to register any positive change at community level.

JWG's clearest contribution to child well-being can be seen in the Health and Nutrition Technical Programme (strategic goal 5), which has directly benefitted 21,205 children. This represents an increase of 24% in the number of directly benefitted children since FY14 and is a clear example of a programme being successfully scaled up based on evidence-based learning of previous years.

An essential contribution was made to child well-being through the Gaza emergency response and early recovery programme, which continued into FY15 following the 2014 Gaza war. These activities benefitted 24,095 children, including 186 disabled children who were mainstreamed into WorldVision's psycho-social support programme in what must be considered one of FY15's programming highlights. Also incorporated into the Gaza recovery work was childcentred DRR work, aiming to build the resilience of children in the likely event of further violent conflict.

WV JWG is very satisfied with the process of preparing this report. Over 50 staff including field officers and senior management were involved in what has been a valuable learning experience.

I Total figure was calculated based on aggregation of figures under each TP (see Strategic Goals section) plus Gaza early recovery (see Disaster Management section). It was estimated that 50% of children benefitting from school interventions under the Health TP also benefitted under Education, Protection & Participation TP and the total figure has been adjusted accordingly.

Introduction

Overview

This report is a summary of World Vision Jerusalem-West Bank-Gaza's contribution to child well-being. It reflects the achievements of JWG's FY15 programming and summarizes progress measured in FY15 towards JWG's Strategic Goals and World Vision International's Child Well Being Targets (CWBTs).

JWG's National Office Strategy comprises six CWB-related Strategic Goals. Progress towards these goals is presented in this report through a focus on JWG's three recently adopted Technical Programmes (TPs), which encompass all Area Programmes (APs)-level programming (former ADP Primary Focus Areas). Key outcome indicators presented in this report include (progress is indicated where comparative data sets are available):

- 40% of children (45% of girls, 35% of boys) can read with comprehension, compared with a national target of 70%
- 11% of children (14% of girls, 8% of boys) live in a safe neighborhood
- 62% of children live in housholds with at least one employed adult (down from 64% in FY14)
- 52% of targeted children are exclusively breastfed until 6 months of age (compared with 27% at intake into programme)

The achievements across all six Strategic Goals plus Gaza emergency response and early recovery projects have directly benefitted 92,485 children. Direct project expenditure in FY15 totalled \$10,708,808.

Learning

This report follows on from the FY14 version as another successful learning process. Evidence of last year's learnings is clearly visible in JWG's programming. Specific examples of this include:

- The FY14 report's findings on reading comprehension have led directly to an enhanced focus on this issue in FY15 programmes' designs and plans, yet functioning across all APs in FY16.
- The recommendation to scale-up MCHN interventions was implemented in FY15, with positive results (see Health and Nutrition section). A related recommendation on further developing the ttC model was also adopted in FY 15 and "enhanced ttC"² is ready to be piloted in FY16.
- Greater clarity and consistency in Economic Development programming is being achieved in FY15, although more streamlined programming (reduced number of different types of intervention) and thorough training of staff in technical models (notably Business Facilitation) is being attained in FY16.
- Recommendations to enhance JWG's Faith in Development work were adopted through a new Faith in Development framework (in FY15) and revised Strategy Goals in FY16.

Last year's learnings on monitoring and CWB Report processes have also been applied to this year's reporting process. This is most visibly seen in the improved quality and presentation of data, which has been enabled by the following:

- The lack of consistent monitoring tools and programme approaches was a key learning from FY14's report, which has now been rectified. Common monitoring across all APs is the key factor in making FY15's report an improved learning process.
- A recommendation to reassess certain indicators has been implemented, leading to adoption of revised indicators and updated baseline survey. This new survey has provided higher quality and more relevant data, which has also contributed to the improved quality of this report.

Context

Whilst the programming context was stable in the West Bank, at the start of FY15, Gaza was still in the aftermath of the 2014 war. Emergency and recovery programming was, therefore, the main focus of WV's work in Gaza. Regular AP programming resumed in April, 2015, whilst certain recovery activities (mainly agricultural rehabilitation and psychosocial support for children) continued along with an increased focus on DRR.

Furthermore, FY15 has been a transitional year in terms of programming, staffing and partnerships in JWG. It was the first year where all five zonal offices shared the same Technical Approaches and designs. Revision process and finalization of JWG's Technical programmes has taken place alongside with intensive capacity building for JWG staff holding new positions, to ensure programme effectiveness.

Enhanced ttC: Integrating mental health and psychosocial support and Early Child stimulation with ttC messaging.

About the Data

The main outcome indicator findings are based on the following data sources:

- Updated baseline survey (Jan16). Although a baseline survey was conducted in FY14, an updated survey was undertaken in early 2016 due to a number of new indicators that were introduced as part of the finalisation of JWG's three Technical Programmes. The baseline measurements were conducted in early 2016 yet reflecting FY15 processes and interventions. The baseline survey was based on WV standard indicators and tools wherever possible and used a non-experimental design. A two-stage cluster sample probability proportional to cluster size (PPS) was used and sample sizes were calculated for a 5% margin of error at 95% confidence level.
- Annual ttC monitoring survey (baseline Oct-14, endline Sep-15) which was conducted with targeted mothers (100% of the target group)
- Ministry of Education national reading comprehension test data for grade 4 students (2015). MoE calculated
 results based on a sample of 1,854 students selected from WV-targeted schools (West Bank only³). Students
 were proportionately sampled per village per gender to ensure adequate representation across targeted areas
 using the PSS methodology. The findings have a confidence interval of 95%.
- Economic Development goal indicators not included in the updated baseline survey were measured in Jan/ Feb-16 using LQAS methodology to monitor the progress of FY15 interventions at the goal level.
- Monitoring data for individual APs (FY15).

A variety of other data sources are used, as referenced within the report itself. The availability of quality data was much improved compared with FY14. The only limitation was due to a teachers' strike, which significantly delayed school-based baseline measurement, some of which was not available in time for this report.

The report was developed using an adapted version of the 10 Steps. The most important feature was the interactive staff workshops, which combined the "analyse" and "discuss" steps. Over 50 staff members were engaged in these (including Gaza staff who were unable to participate in FY14). The increased depth of engagement, reflection and honest discussion from programme staff during these workshops was the highlight of the reporting process. For sure, a healthy culture of evidence-based learning is developing in JWG! A draft report was reviewed by Zonal Managers and feedback on the report's key findings was provided by the Senior Leadership Team, which has endorsed the lessons learned and recommendations contained within.

No Gaza data could be obtained due to WV's strict policy of no contact with the de facto government in Gaza.

3

Strategic Goals

JWG's strategy comprises six Strategic Goals. In order to best align with JWG's programming, this section is structured according to JWG's three recently-adopted Technical Programmes, which form the basis for all ADP programming. The "Education, Participation & Protection" TP aligns with three of JWG's Strategic Goals, whilst the Economic Development and Health & Nutrition TPs align with one Strategic Goal each. The fourth part of this section, Faith in Development, aligns to Strategic Goal 4, but is not covered by a Technical Programme.

👋 🎟 👯 Education, Protection and Participation

Strategic Goal I:

A generation of children empowered to positively influence their future and proactively participate in their family and societal affairs

Strategic Goal 3:

Children enjoy life with dignity in a safe and caring environment

Strategic Goal 6:

Children enjoy improved quality of education in a safe and rewarding environment

SDG 4:

Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all



Summary of Logic Chain:

Children in Palestine are vulnerable in multiple ways. They are regularly exposed to physical and psychological violence; at home and school, where physical punishment is acceptable and common⁴. They are also affected by the actions of settlers and occupation forces (particularly for communities living in West Bank Area C) and, in Gaza where children are frequently exposed to war.

7

⁴ Unicef's 2014 report, *Hidden in Plain Sight – A statistical analysis of violence against children,* places Palestine in the top 10 countries in the world across a range of indicators relating to physical and psychological violence against children at home, school and in the community.

Children lack participation in decisions that affect them at family and community level. Lack of awareness of their own rights discourages them from having an active voice in issues that affect them. Children's vulnerability is also increased because of deficiencies in the education system with low reading comprehension a significant concern, especially for boys. Children's vulnerability is increased because of deficiencies in the education system. Despite high enrolment rates (94.3% in formal basic education)⁵, the quality of learning does not educate children for life nor enhance their life skills. Low reading comprehension is a significant concern, especially for boys. The result is often students with low academic performance and lacking the necessary skills to encounter challenges proactively and positively.

Through its Education & Child Protection Technical Programme, WV seeks to promote a community culture that protects children's rights and provides a safe environment for children to thrive in and be educated for life. The core of this work is schools, where WV strives to increase children's participation (e.g. through school councils), reduce exposure to violence (e.g. through awareness raising and child protection incident reporting) and enhance educational quality (e.g. through programmes for children with learning difficulties and "active classroom" model). Alongside this, WV targets a number of interventions at other levels; for example, supporting partner NGOs working with children in detention and working with the Ministry of Education (MoE) to develop curriculum materials that will sustainably enhance child protection. In Gaza, WV has strived to protect children from the trauma of war (see Emergency Response section).

Resources

Number of Projects

Direct Project Expenditure \$4,108,507

Sources of funding Sponsorship and PNS

Number of Technical Staff

Key Partners

- Ministry of Education Ministry of Social Affairs
- Schools and village councils
- Several local NGOs and CBOs
- Defence for Children International (INGO)
- Early Childhood Resource Centre (ECRC)

Project Highlights

- **1,810** children participated in programmes for children with learning difficulties
- **524** educational staff (teachers and counselors) trained
- 401 teachers participated in trainings on effective teaching methods (287 applied the new methods benefiting around 8,340 children)
- 95 student councils formed including 665 children and conducting 203 initiatives
- 60 educational facilities enhanced
- 40,115 children participated in extracurricular programmes.
- 9,392 children participated in awareness raising sessions on child rights and protection.

Beneficiaries Impacted

Direct beneficiaries:

Adults: 1509 (460 males, 1049 females) Children: 51915 (26406 males, 25509 females)

Indirect Beneficiaries

Adults: 40100 (21750 males, 18350 females) Children: 8542 (4758 males, 3784 females)

Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics, http://www.pcbs.gov.ps/site/lang__en/881/default.aspx#Education

5

Achievements and Analysis

Strategic Goal I: A generation of children empowered to positively influence their future and proactively participate in their family and societal affairs

WV's work towards this goal continued to be mainly directed at building the capacity of young leaders who are part of youth based committees (formed by WV) and providing support for youth-led initiatives. Around 665 children and youth were proactive in developing and implementing 203 initiatives at school and community level. At national level, through WV's National Youth Forum (NYF), children chose to advocate with decision makers on the issue of school absenteeism and its root cause such as school violence, early marriage and low academic performances for students. The highlight of this work was a television panel discussions featuring members of the forum and key figures including the Minister of Education, who pledged his commitment to addressing these issues.



The FY14 CWB Report highlighted the lack of attention to strong monitoring of this goal. In response to this, baseline data was collected for the first time using the "Ladder of Life" tool through a population based survey. Findings (as shown on graph to the left) indicate low scores, especially for girls⁶. Data also shows differences among the West Bank and Gaza APs, with higher rates in Gaza (39.4%) compared to West Bank (17.8 %).⁷ This data was not expected, as general vulnerability in Gaza, is much higher than the West Bank. Through further analysis and triangulation with children's focus groups discussions (FGDs), it appeared that children in Gaza were comparing their current situation with the time of war, thus ranking themselves in higher steps on the ladder of life.

Finding can be used to measure change in the next CWB Report, but it is observed that the low scale of activities under this goal makes it unlikely that there will be goal-level change. On the other hand, effective engagement of children in advocacy may bring positive benefits for other strategic goals.

Strategic Goal 3: Children enjoy life with dignity in a safe and caring environment

WV conducted a baseline in January 2016 on this goal using new indicators. The results are shocking and have provided insights about the effectiveness of WVJWG programming in FY15 (see graph below):

The first indicator (Below) shows that around half of children do know of the presence of services to receive and respond to reports of abuse, neglect, exploitation or violence against children (it does not indicate whether they use these services or not). Data shows no major difference between girls and boys but significant differences between APs⁸. Children in the West Bank APs seem to have more knowledge of the presence of such mechanisms compared to Gaza APs. This is mainly due to efforts done by the MoE within WB schools on this topic as well as WV's contribution in conducting awareness raising sessions in the WB. The second indicator (right) shows that only a small minority of children feel safe in their neighbourhoods and there is a significant difference between boys and girls⁹. This might be attributed to the conservative culture that does not allow girls to actively engage in social life, yet this needs further investigation.

⁶ Confidence interval is (-25.3%, 17.9%) and the p-value is 0.000.

⁷ The difference is considered significant as the confidence interval is (-25.3%, 17.9%) and the p-value is 0.000.

⁸ The confidence interval between Bethlehem AP (63.8%) and North Gaza AP (15.8%) is (-5.4%, -4.1%) and the p-value is 0.000.

⁹ The confidence interval is (-8.2%, -4.6%) with P-value of 0.000



Additional baseline data helps explain why both girls and boys feel unsafe. Notably, violence at schools from teachers against children (33.8%) is higher than at home from parents (23%)¹⁰. A result, that is consistent with the Palestinian national data findings¹¹. Data also showed that 22.2% of boys and 10.1% of girls indicated that their friends are "inappropriately touched".¹² Without earlier data sets, it is not possible to show any change in the situation based on WV's interventions. A mismatch can, however, be observed between these critical issues and FY15's child protection programming, which focused on gender based violence and internet safety. Significant results were achieved in both areas¹³, however the child protection issues raised by the baseline data call into question the relevance of such projects for the context.



- 10 The confidence interval is (-12.6%, -8.8%) with P-value of 0.000.
- 11 The status of the rights of Palestinian Children 2014, PCBS
- 12 The confidence interval is (-14.2%, -10%) with P-value of 0.000

13 KCSO 2015 evaluation findings: 67.6% of children (2015), compared to 0% (2011), in Nahalin and Awarta villages, understand and are protecting other children from risks of internet and mobile. Additionally there was 81.2% increase (2011: 25.6% -2015: 46.4%) in children who fully applied the set of internet safety measures. As for the GBV project, the 2015 evaluation findings -using quasi-experimental design- show that targeted youth are more knowledgeable on GBV issues and are more confident and empowered in assuming actions against them.

Strategic Goal 6: Children enjoy improved quality of education in a safe and rewarding environment

A key finding of the FY14 CWB Report was the serious deficiency in reading comprehension amongst targeted communities (only 28% of children who can read with comprehension). The FY14 data was calculated using a low sample size, so in order to verify this finding, a new survey was conducted in FY15. The results (refer graph below) are higher than presented in FY14, but still of sufficient concern to validate the FY14 report's recommendation that reading comprehension should be a high programming priority.



Higher baseline values were noted in APs that had invested in programmes for children with learning difficulties in previous years. Success in these programmes continued in FY15 with around 56% (1013/1810) of targeted children showing educational improvement¹⁴, although without earlier data sets, it is not possible to demonstrate clear attribution. However, similar to FY14 data, there is a significant difference in relation to gender where girls scored higher than boys across APs.¹⁵ This might be attributed to more investment by the MoE and other partners in Girls' schools.

Nevertheless, WV, through the Regional Education Action Learning (REAL project), supports young children to develop, learn and get ready for school. Baseline data (focused on Hebron Zone) showed that only 49% (220/458) of children passed the school readiness test which indicates poor Early Childhood Development learning environment. Without earlier data sets, it is not possible to show any change in the situation based on WV interventions, however, JWG Early Childhood Development concept is part of the evidence building within the Education Learning Hub.

Key learning points

- Resources in this TP are being spread very thinly. Child Protection issues remain critical (and are perhaps worsening) yet, comparatively few resources allocated to addressing these and, arguably, are focused on the wrong issues.
- Reading comprehension remains a critical issue, but other areas of intervention may be considered a lower priority.
- Strategy Goal I has very few resources devoted to it, such that community-level impact is likely impossible to achieve.

¹⁴ WV APs monitoring reports 2015

¹⁵ The confidence interval for the difference between boys and girls proportions is (-13.8%, -4.9%) with P-value of 0.000.

Recommendations

- Allocation of resources should be carefully considered from FY17 onwards to ensure priority needs are adequately addressed. In particular, the issue of violence against children needs higher priority.
- Strategy Goal I should be reconsidered to make it more relevant and realistic, giving funding constraints (note: this is happening through FY16's strategy revision process)
- JWG should continue to develop approaches aimed at enhancing reading comprehension and, if successful, should look to scale-up these.

Most Vulnerable Children:

Education programming targets the school-level, but within schools 1810 most vulnerable children were reached through programmes for children with learning difficulties from whom 56% showed educational improvement. Child protection interventions and incident reporting and actions are directed towards children who are vulnerable. Furthermore, special focus is given to enhance the safety measures in schools located in area "C"¹⁶.

Sustainability:

Partnership: "WV is much respected at the community level", quoted from the Deputy Minister of Education. WV works in strong collaboration with the MoE through a long-term partnership formalised by a multi-year MOU. WV was intentional in its planning to invest in "in house capacity" of MoE and schools' teachers and counsellors so that the results can be sustained beyond the program duration.

Transformed relationships: WV seeks through its programming within schools to create a caring trustful relationship between students and teachers through introducing new interactive teaching methods. During FY15, around 71% of the targeted 401 teachers applied the new interactive teaching methods with the students, which, according to the school administration has created a positive and enjoyable learning environment for children in class. Furthermore, through the formation of the student councils, the patriarchal social norms are challenged, when allowing children to voice their concerns and call for their rights in a structured way. Girls are also given an equal opportunity to participate and express their opinion.

To create caring and trusting relationships and reinforce values and practices within households and communities, WV, in Jenin Zone, has built the capacity of 30 Muslim Faith Leaders on child protection issues, such as early marriage, child labour and violence against children. Faith Leaders have addressed those issues and have raised the awareness of 6410 head of households through the Friday payers. Although no monitoring tools were used to measure the impact at the community level, faith leaders have articulated the acceptance and high willingness of the targeted people to adopt positive practices towards their children.

¹⁶ Area C is in the West Bank but under full Israeli civil and security control. The Palestinian MOE is restricted from maintaining, expanding and/or constructing educational facilities in this area.

Strategic Goal 2:

Households have improved and diversified livelihood to reduce vulnerability of children

SDG 2:

End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition, and promote sustainable agriculture.

SDG 10:

Reduce inequality within and among countries.



Summary of logic chain

The fragile Palestinian economy has experienced significant decline over the past decade, as evidenced by high unemployment (27% in 2014¹⁷, 37% amongst youth¹⁸ and 33% for women¹⁹) and rising food insecurity (Gaza: from 44% in 2011 to 57% in 2012, West Bank: from 17% in 2011 to 19% in 2012 in the West Bank²⁰). WV's Economic Development TP aims to improve household livelihoods through a focus on two sub-objectives. The first is enhancing female and male youth's ability to secure waged employment, which aims to address the following two root causes: lack of secured income and the low contribution of women to household income. The challenge for youth to find employment is exacerbated by Palestine's demographic profile (55% of the population is under 25²¹) and a significant mis-match between training and job opportunities (the unemployment rate of a university graduate is 1.5 times that of youth with no education). The second sub-objective is to support the initiation and improvement of profitable and sustainable new/existing small businesses in target communities, which seeks to tackle the lack of secure income, poor marketing skills, the use of outdated technologies (for agricultural businesses) and seeks to encourage talented youth into entrepreneurship as a career path.

¹⁷ The status of the rights of Palestinian Children 2014, PCBS.

¹⁸ Youth labor market transitions oPt, 2014, ILO

¹⁹ Socio-Economic & Food Security Report, 2012, issued by (PCBS), FAO, UNRWA and WFP

²⁰ Socio-Economic & Food Security Report, 2012, issued by (PCBS), FAO, UNRWA and WFP

²¹ CIA World Factbook, 2015

Resources

Number of Projects

Direct Project Expenditure 2,158,262 USD

Source of funding Sponsorship, Grants (AMENCA 2), PNS

Number of Technical Staff 8

Key Partners Ministry of Labour Vocational training centres Ministry of Agriculture Union of Agricultural Work Committees (UAWC) Local CBOs, CBCs and village committees Chambers of Commerce

Project Highlights

- 98 of (32 male and 66 female) youth joined WV internship programmes, 8 of whom are disabled.
- 249 (172 male and 77 female) youth joined WV vocational training programmes.
- Eight Community Business Councils (CBCs established in eight ADPs.
- 69 existing businesses supported (received tools or got new skills/ trainings)
- 376 (338 male and 38 female) farmers supported with agricultural activities, including land rehabilitation.
- Around 5% of the beneficiaries are people with disabilities.
- II8 women supported with access to economic opportunities

Beneficiaries Impacted

Direct beneficiaries: Adults: 4737 (3179 males, 1558 females)

Policy Level Beneficiaries Adults: 234 (159 males, 75 females) Indirect Beneficiaries Adults: 3591 (933 males, 2658 females) Children: 12712 (6482 males, 6230 females)

Achievements and analysis

In order to monitor progress achieved in FY15 against baseline indicators, monitoring was undertaken in early FY16 using the LQAS methodology. Key results that focus on achievements and contribution to change during FY15 (for West Bank APs), are presented in the graph below:



The first indicator (left) shows a decrease in self-employment rates²². This is mainly attributed to compared mis-match between the growing labour force²³ (driven by Palestine's demographic profile) and a lack of self-employment, especially for youth. For waged employment, however, there is a small increase²⁴ due to improved access of the workers to the Israeli market as well as to the local market in some of the targeted areas where large construction projects were conducted during FY15. Food diversity remained stable, which is unsurprising given no significant change in household employment status. ²⁵ In Gaza, however, the FY15 final evaluation of the Australia DFAT-funded AMENCA 2 project revealed that 70% of the HHs' supported under the project showed increased consumption of diversified and nutritious food with an annual average 46% increase of sustained income.

While the timeframe is too short to register impact at a community level, positive results were achieved for beneficiaries engaged in WV employment-related programmes. Specifically, at least 347 youth were involved in vocational training, internships or small business support in FY15.A sample survey of 206 of these youth (conducted in September, 2015) revealed that 143 (69.4%) of them had found an employment opportunity (48 in waged employment and 95 self-employed). Self-employment using vocational skills was encouraged by several APs and supported with further training and, in some APs, start-up tools/equipment were also provided. Similar success was achieved using two different approaches: in West Jenin AP, a 70% success rate was achieved where youth were provided with tools/equipment to start up their businesses in addition to training, whereas in South Nablus an 80% success rate was achieved without tools/equipment being provided²⁶.

In all cases, the timeframe is considered too short to assess whether these new businesses will be sustainable.

Key learning points

- Positive results were achieved for youth who were able to start their own business in APs -similar success rates were achieved where small businesses were supplied with tools/equipment and where they were not. The sustainability of these businesses is, however, unclear given the high level of support and short timeframe.
- Positive results have been achieved in youth employment interventions (vocational training and internship), but the scale of these interventions is too small to make big impact. This emphasizes the need for interventions at the community-level and validates interventions such as the Business Facilitation model and its Community Business Council component, which aims at strengthening the local business environment to achieve wider impact.
- LQAS methodology is a useful methodology for monitoring that provides insights for reflections on the implementation process and for decision making.

Recommendations

- LQAS should be incorporated into outcome indicator monitoring annually.
- Further analysis is needed on small business activities in order to assess their sustainability and identify key ingredients for success (note: this will be achieved through the Business Facilitation Evidence Building Plan that will commence in FY16).

Most Vulnerable Children:

The Economic Development programme addresses general vulnerability at the community level (which is determined by AP target location selection), rather than the vulnerability of specific MVCs. This emphasizes the need for ED interventions which benefit the whole community rather than a small number of specific beneficiaries (many of whom would not be considered the most vulnerable) in order that MVCs within the community may benefit (for example, youth likely to be unemployed once they leave school). Although priority is given to youth with disability in the selection process of youth, WV JWG acknowledges the need for conducting a mapping process to better identify the MVC and respond to their needs within each of the Technical programme, a process that has already started in FY16.

There is a difference between the two values in relation to time horizon as the confidence interval for this indicator is (3.1%, 10%) with a p-value of 0.000.

²³ The number of persons participating in the labour force in Palestine was about 1,273,100 in 2014 and 1,325,000 in 2015

²⁴ Confidence interval for the two proportions is (-7.8%,-1.1%) with a p-value of 0.004

²⁵ Confidence interval for the difference is (-6.3%, 0.7%) with a p-value of 0.063, so there is not enough evidence to show that there is real difference between the two values.

²⁶ WV APs monitoring reports, 2015.

Sustainability:

Partnership: A strong partnership is developing with the Ministry of Labour (MoL), based on the principles of equity, transparency and mutual benefit. The focus of this partnership is vocational training for youth, which WV is supporting financially, but also through advocating and working with the ministry to enhance the quality and relevance of training programmes. During FY15, new programmes were introduced to youth based on their needs, benefiting 234 youth. These improved programmes will be rolled out beyond WV target communities, potentially benefitting thousands of Palestinian youth.

Social Accountability: WV seeks to empower local communities to enhance the business environment through the formation of eight Community Business Councils (CBCs) in FY15. WV supports these CBCs in identifying local business needs and planning to achieve them, mainly through advocacy which will positively affect small businesses' ability to grow and compete.



& Health and Nutrition

Strategic Goal 5: Children and their families embrace healthier and more active lifestyles within safer environments

		t all ages	
Children are cared for protected and participating	Educated for life	Enjoy Good Health	Experience love of God and their neighbors
	urished ed from infection and c are givers access essent		
from infect		ildren protected ildren who are well-	
 % of children under 5 wi diarrhea % of children under 5 wi provider 			
provider			
Children are well nourished Prevalence of underweig Prevalence of wasting in	children under five ye	ears of age	
Children are well nourished Prevalence of underweig Prevalence of wasting in	children under five ye breastfed until 6 mor hs receiving Vitamin /	ears of age oths of age A capsules	

Summary of logic chain

Child health is a significant concern in Palestine. Maternal and infant nutrition is especially poor with over 10% of children stunted²⁷ and less than one-third exclusively breastfed²⁸. Anaemia is prevalent amongst pregnant women (25%) and children (42%)²⁹. These health issues are the result of poor health and nutrition knowledge and practice, especially in rural areas where primary health services are of limited capacity.

To improve community health, WV works at three levels – household, community (incl. schools) and system. At household level, WV promotes best practices in maternal and child health and nutrition through Community Health Workers (CHWs) who provide timely, targeted counselling to pregnant women and young mothers. At community level, Community Active Groups (CAGs) are trained and organized to respond to the community's needs and act as a link between targeted communities and the Ministry of Health (MoH). Within schools, World Vision promotes positive health practices among school children. Community level interventions are also supported through awareness raising campaigns. At the system level, WV works with the MoH to improve access to health services through capacity building and promotion of primary health care.

27 The status of the rights of Palestinian Children 2014, PCBS.

²⁸ Health Annual Report, MoH, 2014

²⁹ MoH Annual Report, 2014

Resources

Number of Projects

Direct Project Expenditure 819,406 USD

Source of funding Sponsorship and PNS

Number of Technical Staff

Key Partners

- Ministry of Health
- Ministry of Education (School Health Department)
- Local health CBOs
- Palestinian Red Crescent Society
- Palestinian Medical Relief Society

Project Highlights

- 8731 mothers of children under five received advice and support on nutrition and treating infectious diseases
- 146 Community Health Workers active at household level.
- 195 awareness sessions conducted by Community Active Groups benefiting more than 7760 mothers.
- 11,599 students (5,134 boys and 6,465 girls) reached through school health clubs.
- 132 MoH staff trained identified by their directorates.

Beneficiaries Impacted

Direct beneficiaries:

Adults: 19,970 (90 males, 19,880 females) Children: 21,205 (10,029 males, 11,176 females)

Indirect Beneficiaries Adults: 20,691(12402 males, 8289 females)

Adults: 20,691 (12402 males, 8289 females) Children: 47,272 (24104 males, 23168 females)

Policy Level Beneficiaries Children: 612 (312 males, 300 females)



Achievements and Analysis

Achievements in FY15 show a contribution to JWG's Strategic Goal 5 as well as to CWB Targets 2 and 3.

Children are well nourished:

Data on wasting and underweight was collected for the first time in early FY16. It is interesting to note that the data for targeted communities shows higher prevalence than at governorate level³⁰. Higher prevalence rates reflect more vulnerability in WV targeted communities in terms of food insecurity and poverty.





For other key indicators, comparative data is available to assess the impact of WV interventions with the targeted mothers, as presented below:



30 Governorate figures include all governorates in which WV target communities are located. The confidence interval for the difference between governorate and WV targeted areas in regards of underweight is (-8.7%, -6.8%) with P-value of 0.000. Likewise, the confidence interval for the difference between the governorate and WV targeted areas in regards of wasting is (-5.2%, -3.7%) with P-value of 0.000.

As with FY14, the above data shows significant positive change in several indicators, notably the increase in the percentage of children that are exclusively breastfed, which has nearly doubled (from 27.1% to 51.6%³¹). AP-level analysis was undertaken in order to identify positive deviance. One remarkable example was found in Nablus AP where the proportion of children who received minimum acceptable diet rose from 6% to 86%. This significant result (across a cohort of 302 children) is attributed to the intentional prioritization of this issue by CHWs, following very low baseline results. Specifically, the standard ttC model was complemented by CHWs conducting monthly sessions to promote this particular issue.

Unlike FY14, no positive change was achieved relating to anaemia rates. However, within individual APs, significant differences among APs were noted. Further analysis showed correlation between time of ttC interventions and change. Positive change was achieved in APs adopting the ttC for a longer period of time. For example, in Bethlehem AP (where ttC has been conducted since 2009), a 44% decrease in anaemia amongst children under 2 years was achieved while in South Hebron AP (where ttC has been conducted since 2013), an 11% decrease was achieved. Bethlehem AP also outperformed other APs in other indicators, which is attributed to this being the first AP to adopt the ttC model and, thus, CHWs in this area now have up to five years' experience. A general trend was noted of stronger results amongst APs that had been implementing ttC longer. With regard to anaemia, a shortage in iron/folate in the health centres appears also to have been a contributing factor to the low results in some areas.

Children are protected from infection and disease



For diarrhoea and pneumonia management indicators comparative data is shown in the graph below

Similar to FY14 findings, the change is positive with regard to pneumonia management, which is a component of the ttC approach³². However, minor positive difference was noted in diarrhoea management in FY15³³. Moreover, the baseline for this indicator was two-thirds lower than last year. It is again noted that those APs with greater capacity and experience in implementing ttC showed positive deviance (Bethlehem and Nablus APs saw improvement from 9.7% to 20.9% and 6.8% to 17.2% respectively). The reasons for the low baselines are not, however, known.

- 31 The confidence interval for the difference between pre and post values for the targeted women -29.1%, -19.8% with P-value of 0.000.
 32 The confidence interval for the difference between pre and post values for the targeted women in regards of pneumonia is (-18.3%, -12.4%) with P-value of 0.000
- The confidence interval for the difference between pre and post values for the targeted women in regards of diarrhea is (-5.2%, -1.8%) with P-value of 0.000.

Advocacy efforts from WV achieved success in the decision by all Directorates of Health in the targeted villages to grant formal registration of CHW's as Directorates of Health's Volunteers. This status gives more credibility to the CHWs and enhances the sustainability of the CHWs' work.

Key learning points

- ttC continues to yield effective results, especially on the important indicator of exclusive breastfeeding, even following the significant scale-up in FY15.
- Results are, however, generally lower for APs newly adopting the ttC model, which points towards the greater effectiveness of more experienced CHWs.
- Intentionally directing efforts to specific health issues and including this as part of the CHWs agreements has led to significant positive change in Nablus APs.

Recommendations

- In APs newly adopting the ttC model, strong attention and follow up for the CHWs are needed beyond the initial training in order to ensure ongoing development of CHWs to enhance their effectiveness. It is important not to overlook this during scale-up to ensure quality programming.
- Priority needs should be identified in each area and specifically targeted by CHWs, rather than all CHWs only adopting the general focus across all health messaging.

Most Vulnerable Children:

Baseline on data for wasting and stunting make it clear that WV is targeting vulnerable communities. Through the selection process of targeted mothers, priority was given to mothers with disabled children and mothers with poor health conditions or have children with poor health conditions.

Sustainability:

Local ownership: The central role of CHWs (all of whom are volunteers from the target communities) and the Community Action Groups ensure that the programme is facilitated rather than owned by WV – the communities are the real owners.

Partnership: Partnership with the Ministry of Health was formalized in FY15 through a multi-year MoU. Through this MoU, partnering relationships for CWB were reflected based on the principles of equity, transparency and mutual benefit. One of the major focuses of this partnership, is enhancing health centres' services and outreach activities, which WV is providing capacity building trainings for health clinics staff, and supporting the work of the CHWs to expand the outreach activities.

Transformed Relationships: An essential component of the ttC model is the engagement of other family members (notably husbands and mothers-in-law). The result is often a changed family dynamic whereby the mother receives far greater support from family members. "Through attending WV training sessions, I have acknowledged that I should let my son's wife treat her baby as per CHWs recommendations and that I even should help her it that." (Quote from one of the mother in laws targeted through the programme). CHWs (who are all women) also report positive impact in their status and empowerment, both in their homes and the community as a result of their community health work.

Social Accountability: WV supported the local community to advocate for re-opening the health clinic in Um Lasafa village, a remote village in South Hebron, with the Directorate of Health. The clinic is now functioning and providing more than 600 children with health services.

Strategic Goal 4: Staff, parishes & AP communities are resilient and spiritually enriched by WV



Summary of Logic chain

Living under Israeli occupation is one of the most enduring causes of poverty and insecurity in Palestine. The measures imposed on communities negatively affect their well-being driving them to lose hope for the future. This has resulted in having high emigration rates, especially among Christians, for economic reasons, security reasons and to be able to live more freely. WV has worked to strengthen the Christian community by nurturing the spiritual growth and health of children and families and equipping them with the skills, confidence, and resources to understand and actively live out messages of peace through ongoing and sustainable community development programmes.

Resources	Project Highlights
Number of ProjectsIDirect Project Expenditure484,750 USDSource of fundingPNSNumber of Technical Staff2Key PartnersChurches and Christian organisations	 50 Christian youth participated in leadership workshops 26 Christian fresh graduates benefitted from vocational training or internship opportunities created through VVV partnerships. Around 30 local churches and other faith-based organisations were supported with capacity building opportunities and tools, benefiting more than 600 children. 320 children joined spiritual nurture activities including summer camps and Christmas spiritual nurture sessions. 5 Celebrating Families workshops were conducted for all VVV field staff. More than 80 WV advocacy staff, pastors and leaders joined the advocacy trips and visits for the Holy Land.

Beneficiaries Impacted

Direct beneficiaries:

Adults: 255 (174 women, 81 men) Children: 1070 (524 girls, 546 boys) Indirect Beneficiaries Children: 8000 (4,080 males, 3,920 females)

Achievements and analysis

Faith in Development interventions remained small scale due to limited funding (the Palestinian Church Engagement Initiative (PCEI) was this goal's only project). During FY15, a new Faith in Development strategy was developed in order to give greater focus and a clearer direction to WV's work in this area. A survey of the Christian community was also initiated, in order to more accurately assess their particular needs, and target programming accordingly. This survey will be completed in FY16. In addition, stronger networks were established within the Christian community and partners were invited to participate in various workshops, which aimed at enhancing WV's links with the Christian community and learning how to better support it.

The PCEI project sought to create a network of advocates who are equipped, mobilized and motivated to achieve peace and justice in the Holy Land. This was mainly done through conducting exchange advocacy trips and visits to the Holy Land. The Evaluation of the PCEI revealed that, these trips were successful in terms of providing information for participants about WV work and the injustices in the Holy Land; where 87% said that they changed their views about the Holy Land by going on the tour and 100% of them said the trip gave them insights into WV's work in the Holy Land. The project also included a US-based component (implemented by WVUS) which sought to advocate with US decision-makers on violations against children in the Holy Land and other conflict-related issues. Although both the tours and the US-based advocacy are widely regarded as relevant to WV's wider advocacy work, the link to this (or other) Strategy Goal is not clear. Moreover, no monitoring was conducted to measure the impact of either.

Most Vulnerable Children::

WV supported 16 children with mental disabilities and youth through the establishment of multi-sensory stimulation room, in one of the faith based organization that is specialized in working with people with disability. Around 35 children with visual impairments were also supported through rehabilitating their kindergarten playground to make it disability accessible.

Sustainability:

Partnership: WV FinD project is mainly implemented through partners. Working with churches and other faithbased organisations and building their capacity, has enabled them to be actively engaged in their communities and has increased their influence, thus being able to better work for the well-being of the Christian children.

Key learning points

The lessons of FY14 were validated by the PCEI project evaluation, which raised concerns about the strategic clarity of this project and effectiveness of monitoring. These concerns are being addressed through the revision of Faith in Development framework (already completed), the Christian community survey and revision of Strategy Goal 4 itself for greater clarity and relevance (being undertaken in FY16).

Lessons were also learned about the advocacy components of the FinD projects. More follow up is needed with the participants in order to be able to measure the effectiveness of these trips.

Recommendations:

Strategy goals should be revised to give greater clarity on international advocacy (note: this is being implemented in FY16 strategy revision). Further, enhanced monitoring on advocacy is needed in order to measure its effectiveness (noting that this was also an FY14 recommendation, but has not been achieved yet).WV plans is to work on addressing this issue after finalizing the revision process of the advocacy strategy.

Disaster management

On July 2014, the Israeli army launched a military offensive, code-named "Protective Edge", in Gaza. The 51-day war caused the death of over 2,000 people (including 500 children) and the destruction of around 18,000 homes. The scale and speed of JWG's CAT III response was highly impressive and very effective mainly due to the dedication and experience of the Gaza team and the disaster preparedness work that WV had undertaken in previous years (see FY14 CWB Report). Although emergency response continued in FY15 (CAT III status remained until April, 2015), WV's focus switched quickly to recovery activities, mainly focused on restoring livelihoods through rehabilitation of damaged agricultural lands as well as recovery for traumatized children through a psycho-social support programme. Emergency response interventions that took place were of significant value for effective early recovery interventions, notably the work done in the 40 CFSs. The experienced staff and PFA trainers as well as the well-established CFSs enabled WV to shift easily to different types of psychosocial support interventions for children.

Resources

Number of Projects

4 projects in addition to reallocation of funds from two APs

Direct Project Expenditure 3,137,883 USD

Source of funding Sponsorship, grants and PNS

Number of Technical Staff 2 NO staff, 128 additional staff recruited to Gaza team

Key Partners

- Palestinian Red Crescent Society
- UNRWA
- Local CBOs
- UAWC
- Local community cluster groups

Project Highlights

- 3114 donums and 217 greenhouses rehabilitated for over 500 farmers.
- 367 (333 male, 34 female) cash-for-work workers involved in land rehabilitation 184 fishermen provided with fishing materials and boat repairs.
- 16,360 children (50% boys and 50% girls) provided with psychosocial support and other activities through the 40 CFSs
- 2754 households benefited from Psychological First Aid (PFA)
- 10,000 women benefited from Psychological First Aid awareness sessions.

Beneficiaries Impacted

Direct beneficiaries:

Adults: 13802 (2418 males, 11384 females) Children: 24095 (12,289 males, 11,806 females) Indirect Beneficiaries Children: 55,208 (28156 males, 27052 females)

Achievements & Analysis

Two components of the Gaza recovery programme are particularly worth highlighting:

Psycho-social support

No common tool or indicators were used across projects for measuring the impact of psycho-social programmes, as most of the interventions were considered as an extension to the emergency response interventions. However, the following achievements were noted:

• Focus Group Discussions conducted during the evaluation of the Disaster Emergency Committee (DEC) project (5 CFSs, approximately 2500 children) found that 90% of children enrolled expressed feelings of being happier and calmer as a result. Around 75% of the children's mothers reported that their participation led to reduction in stress and to creating positive attitudes that helped their children forget their current situation.

Monitoring of a German Foreign Office project (11 CFSs, approximately 5000 children) showed that at least 80% of parents who received PFA have improved their knowledge on how to communicate and deal with behavior disorders affecting their children after the war (aggression, hyperactivity, phobia and confused/inappropriate behavior).

Disaster Risk Reduction

As shown in FY14 report, disaster preparedness in Gaza has enhanced WV's capacity to respond to the emergency and yielded tangible benefits to children. DRR activities were, therefore, continued in FY15 both through AP projects, but also incorporated into recovery-focussed grant projects. A highlight is the 10,000 women who have participated in PFA awareness raising sessions of whom (based on the 4601 women surveyed in the German Foreign Office project) more than 70% have learned at least 4 new coping techniques to be used for themselves and their children in a disaster situation.

Most Vulnerable Children

World Vision's recovery programme focused on war-affected children, particularly those who were suffering from trauma. Amongst these, 186 children with physical disabilities were included in Gaza psycho-social programme. A particular focus was given to children with hearing impairments through 11 of the CFSs, not only through the availability of facilitators experienced in sign language, but through providing sign language training to all children, the result of which is that 75% of the 1650 targeted children can now communicate using at least 25 symbols.

Sustainability:

Partnership: To increase likelihood of sustainability in early recovery interventions WV has supported the establishment of 40 CFSs within the local CBOs' structures (22 of them are still functioning) and has provided capacity building opportunity for the CBOs' staff and facilitators to be able to run the CFSs effectively.

Transformed relations: Through including children with hearing impairments in the CFSs activities and providing the opportunity for other children to learn sign language, WV has managed to create caring and trusting relationships among children.

Key learning points

• Recovery activities can be successfully combined with DRR and emergency response interventions.

Recommendations:

• Common tools and indicators for monitoring of psycho-social activities should be developed (note: this has already been done for projects starting in FY16).



DPA components	Comment	Examples	
Programme	JWG has applied all four	Providing information: WV identity, vision and	
Accountability	components of the Programme	core values were shared with more than 1300	
	Accountability Framework	community members, parents and local partners in	
	across all 14 APs and the Gaza	the new Central South Hebron AP.	
	emergency response and recovery		
	interventions.		
		Consulting with communities: The	
	Building on FY14 learnings,	development process for 14 annual DIPs included higher level consultations with the community	
	JWG has enhanced its PAF to	through 5 workshops conducted across all zones	
	communities through promoting	with the participation of 160 steering committee	
	more community consultation and	members.	
	participation.		
	Furthermore, special focus was	Promoting participation: Community	
	given to provide information	participation was mainly evident through the	
	on WV new adopted Technical	Health TP's interventions. 146 Community Health	
	Approaches and programmes and	Workers (CHWs) from targeted communities	
	collect feedback from communities	across all Zones were trained and have participated	
	after the WV JWG restructuring	in providing services for mothers, as well as in	
	process.	collecting M&E data and analysis.	
		Collecting and acting on feedback and	
	However, more can be done to	complaints: in Gaza, 76.3% (361/473) of the	
	improve the PAF to communities	DEC emergency response project's beneficiaries	
	and having clear guidelines	confirmed the presence of a transparent and	
	and consistent monitoring of	efficient complaint mechanism.	
	complaints is still needed.		
Participation	Children's participation is	Children directly influenced the design process	
of children in	intentional and evident. However,	of the new Central South Hebron AP through 2	
programme	more can be done to enhance	workshops involving around 30 children.	
design and M&E	children's decision making.		
Working with	WV works in strong collaboration	WV works in strong collaboration with MoE, MoH	
partners	with partners and works on	and MoL through a multi-year MOU. In East Hebron	
F	building their capacity to lead the	AP (where WV is transitioning) WV has built the	
	change and sustain programme	capacity of Palestinian Red Crescent to adopt and	
	achievements	continue to support the ttC model.	

Key learnings and Recommendations for Improvement

- ✓ Working with community volunteers (such as in the Health programme) enhances programme accountability.
- ✓ Working closely with partners and building their capacities has enabled them to adopt WV ttC model during the transition period.
- ✓ JWG should look to steadily scale-up partnerships with local organisations with a view to enhancing sustainability

Learning from CWB Reporting Process

WV JWG is very pleased with the FY15 reporting process. It has built on the high quality of FY14's report in the following ways:

- Greater consistency in programming (following the LEAP 3 transition) and use of common indicators across all APs has greatly strengthened the quality of data available. In addition, ongoing learning on data presentation methods and sampling methodology (following feedback on the FY14 CWB Report) have enhanced both the technical quality and presentation of the report.
- Better planning allowed the monitoring calendar to be adjusted so as to provide data in ample time for the report. Unlike FY14, there was no last-minute provision of data (although some data was delayed).
- A higher level of engagement by staff was clearly observed. More importantly, staff engagement was focused on analysis of and learning from data, rather than discussions about which data sources to use or on anecdotal evidence. This in return has provided more insights for JWG's leadership to make informed decisions.

The FY15 process was also far more efficient than in FY14, particularly for staff involved in data presentation and reporting writing, for whom the time invested was roughly half what was required in FY14.

JWG fully supports future reports being done bi-annually. This will allow far greater scope for outcome-level change to occur, creating a more meaningful learning opportunity. Other specific recommendations are for the next report, are:

- Continue with data-focused learning sessions on specific topics at half-yearly intervals between now and the next CWB Report. This will allow staff to develop even stronger habits and approaches to evidence-based learning.
- Do test presentations of summarized data prior to staff analysis/discussion workshops. This will allow the chance to enhance presentation and correct any errors. Unfortunately, data confusion and minor errors were a wasteful distraction during the staff workshops.
- Make room for wider stakeholder involvement, including partners and community volunteers. Time constraints meant that this was not possible in FY15 despite this being an FY14 recommendation.

Finally, a general finding, which arose across all sections of the report, is the insufficient level of reporting on advocacy. This is partly due to an inadequate connection between advocacy and Technical Programming (which has now been addressed through JWG's new Advocacy Strategy), but mainly due to poor monitoring of advocacy work. It is recommended that JWG's Advocacy and Quality Assurance departments work closely together (with support from the partnership) to address this concern.